“’Doing’ Democracy Through Diversity: Transformative Pedagogies of Practice and Engagement”

Caryn McTighe Musil
Association of American Colleges and Universities
July 28, 2016
global

think

citizenship

world
Interconnectivity
A Tangled Web of Power and Inequality
In the Modern Age, where everything is connected to everything, the most important thing about what you can do is what you can do with others.
Focus for this morning
What We Can Do with Others: The Three D’s

DOING

DEMOCRACY

DIVERSITY
“We may be born free, but we are not born citizens—we have to acquire the traits that enable us to participate effectively in the world.”
“Democracy works—but you gotta want it.”

“Democracy is not a spectator sport—you have to get in the arena.”
CRISIS IN GLOBAL DEMOCRACY: THEN AND NOW

Aftermath of World War II

Seven Decades Later

Association of American Colleges and Universities
PRINCIPAL GOALS FOR HIGHER EDUCATION FROM THE TRUMAN COMMISSION

- Education for a fuller realization of democracy in every phase of living
- Education directly and explicitly for international understanding and cooperation
- Education for the application of creative imagination and trained intelligence to the solution of social problems and to the administration of public affairs

Higher Education for Democracy, 1947
Diverse democracies require full inclusion in colleges and universities

“No more in mind than body can this nation or any endure half slave, half free. Education that liberates and ennobles must be equally available to all. Justice to the individual demands this; the safety and the progress of the nation depend on it.”

(1947a, 101)
DIVERSITY AS A HIGH IMPACT PRACTICE

• Inclusive curriculum correlates with
  • Pluralistic orientation
  • Perspective taking
  • Tolerance of different beliefs
  • Openness to having one’s views challenged
  • Ability to negotiate controversial issues
  • Ability to work cooperatively with diverse people

(Sylvia Hurtado, 2012)
DIVERSITY AND CIVIC OUTCOMES

• Students enrolled in diversity coursework “demonstrated a strong preference toward...making a difference in society.” (Engberg & Braskamp, 3).

• “[our study] found that students who reported positive, informal interactions with diverse peers...[demonstrated increased] democratic sensibilities including their pluralistic orientation, interest in poverty issues, and concern for the public good” (Hurtado, 191).
Civic outcomes:

- Greater increases in understanding race, gender, and income inequality
- Intergroup empathy and motivation to bridge differences
- Commitment to post-college social and political action
- Greater increases in the efficacy and frequency of their intergroup action during college
- Cognitive opennessness and positivity in intergroup situations.
AND THERE IS MORE. . .

- Out of class engagement with others
  - The more engagement with others of different racial/ethnic groups, the higher their scores on all six civic outcomes in the HERI survey of Diverse Learning Environments
  - The more students are able to engage in diverse interactions on campus, the more likely they are to confront notion of prejudice, take seriously views different than their own, and embrace social justice.

  (ASHE, 2002, ACM)
Figure 1: Relationship Between Course Content or Pedagogy and Pluralistic Orientation

- Service Learning
- Materials/Readings about Race/Ethnicity
- Opportunities for Intensive Dialogue

Number of Courses Taken with Specified Content

Pluralistic Orientation (Mean Score)

A NATIONAL CALL TO ACTION

A CRUCIBLE MOMENT

College Learning & Democracy’s Future

The National Task Force on Civic Learning and Democratic Engagement
FOUND EVIDENCE OF AN ENORMOUS EXPLOSION OF CIVIC ENGAGEMENT AS PART OF CAMPUS LIFE

However, the Good Work is

• Random
• Largely uncharted
• Lacking signage
• Without sufficient progression over time
• Optional
• Available to only some students
Do students say college contributes to their civic growth?

**Figure 5.** Student perceptions of growth in awareness, skills, and commitment toward contributing to community participation.
KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR HIGHER EDUCATION

1. Foster a CIVIC ETHOS across all parts of the campus and educational culture.

2. Make CIVIC LITERACY a core expectation for all students.

3. Practice CIVIC INQUIRY across all fields of study.

4. Advance CIVIC ACTION through transformative partnerships, at home and abroad.
For Democracy’s Future: Five Essential Actions

From The National Task Force on Civic Learning and Democratic Engagement

1. Reclaim and reinvest in the fundamental civic and democratic mission of schools and of all sectors within higher education.

2. Enlarge the current national narrative that erases civic aims and civic literacy as educational priorities contributing to social, intellectual, and economic capital.

3. Advance a contemporary, comprehensive framework for civic learning—embracing US and global interdependence—that includes historic and modern understandings of democratic values, capacities to engage diverse perspectives and people, and commitment to collective civic problem solving.

4. Capitalize upon the interdependent responsibilities of K–12 and higher education to foster progressively higher levels of civic knowledge, skills, examined values, and action as expectations for every student.

5. Expand the number of robust, generative civic partnerships and alliances, locally, nationally, and globally to address common problems, empower people to act, strengthen communities and nations, and generate new frontiers of knowledge.
Need a Contemporary, Comprehensive Definition of Civic Learning

- Contestation and debates about principles
- Diversity past, present, and future
- Navigating multiple perspectives
- Our world, not just my rights
- Interdependence globally and locally
- New modes of collective action
CLDE PEDAGOGIES AND PRACTICES

- Service Learning
- Community-based Research
- Dialogue Across Differences
- Global Civic Engagement
- Campus/Community Partnerships

- Internships
- Social Entrepreneurship
- Social Innovation
- Economic Development
- Sustainability
THE FOUNDATION
HAS ALREADY BEEN PARTIALLY LAID

• Curricular civic pathways
  • Making civic literacy a core expectation for all students in general education programs
    • Tulane University, Portland State University, St. Edward’s University
  • Integrating civic inquiry into a central field of study
    • Worcester Polytechnic Institute, Wagner College, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee
REQUIRED COURSES IN GENERAL EDUCATION

Kingsborough Community College

• Two part requirement for civic learning outcomes
• Can be two designated civic learning courses
• Or can be one designated civic learning course and a campus-centered civic engagement activity

Tulane University

• First course is taken typically in the first year but definitely by the second and usually is a service learning course
• Second course is upper level, typically junior year and can be a policy, research, or community-based project, often connected to the major
Other schools weave civic commitments as part of career preparation

**Worcester Polytechnic University**

- **First year seminars**
  (Feed the World, Power the World, Heal the World, Grand Challenges)

- **Third year project**
  (Intersection of science with social issues and human needs)

- **Senior year project**
  (Synthesize previous study to solve problems or perform tasks in major field.)
THE NEWEST FERTILE FRONTIER:
A CIVIC LENS WITHIN MAJORS

• “For those who see preparation for citizenship as a goal of undergraduate education, the possibilities for where it can be taught expand.”

• “...when faculty from different disciplinary communities teach their fields wearing a civic lens, both the concept of citizenship and even the field itself (as taught and learned) are subject to change.”

Mary Huber and Pat Hutchings

Meta-question:

- How does technology accentuate or reduce historic inequalities? How can my work help bridge the “digital divide”?

Learning Outcomes:

- Understand the community in which the project is being carried out.

- Describe the diversity and social inequalities in the community.

- Able to use technology to reduce social inequality and social isolation.
Meta-Question: *The Triple Bottom Line*

How can businesses balance the “triple bottom lines” of profit, people and planet?

Outcomes:

1. To deepen awareness and understanding of disparities in economic opportunity among different ethnic and cultural groups and the roots of such disparities, within Monterey County, nationally and globally.

2. To gain a clearer sense of the kinds of actions, attitudes and behaviors – personal and institutional - that can alter historical relationships of power and privilege and broaden economic opportunity for those for whom opportunity historically has been limited.
Binding Knowledge with Action

• Connect Knowledge with Choices and Actions

• Do it, practice it, act collaboratively with others on and off campus, especially through hands-on research, action projects, service learning

• Threaded curriculum reinforced by co-curriculum and an arc of student development as a globally responsible citizen
STILL MORE FOUNDATIONS LAID IN NEW WINGS

• Advancing Collaborative, Generative Civic Partnerships and Alliances
  • From charity to reciprocity to generative partnership
    • Syracuse University, Widener College, Anchor Institutions, Community-Campus Partnerships for Health
Janke (2013) adapted from Furco (2009)

Levels of Reciprocity

4. System/Transformative
3. Cooperative
2. Exchange
1. Transactional/Service

Figure One: Cone of Reciprocity in Community Engagement
Adapted from Furco (2010)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FACE/PHASE</th>
<th>COMMUNITY IS...</th>
<th>CIVIC SCOPE</th>
<th>LEVELS OF KNOWLEDGE</th>
<th>BENEFITS...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Exclusionary| only your own       | civic disengagement  | - one vantage point (yours)  
- monocultural                                                                                                                                     | one party                                       |
| Oblivious  | a resource to mine  | civic detachment     | - observational skills  
- largely monocultural                                                                                                                              | one party                                       |
| Naive      | a resource to engage| civic amnesia        | - no history  
- no vantage point  
- acultural                                                                                                                                          | random people                                   |
| Charitable | a resource that needs assistance | civic altruism | - awareness of deprivations  
- affective kindliness and respect  
- multicultural, but yours is still the norm center                                                                                             | the givers’ feelings, the sufferers’ immediate needs |
| Reciprocal | a resource to empower and be empowered by | civic engagement | - legacies of inequalities  
- values of partnering  
- intercultural competencies  
- arts of democracy  
- multiple vantage points  
- multicultural                                                                                                                                     | society as a whole in the present               |
| Generative | an interdependent resource filled with possibilities | civic prosperity | - struggles for democracy  
- interconnectedness  
- analysis of interlocking systems  
- intercultural competencies  
- arts of democracy  
- multiple interactive vantage points  
- multicultural                                                                                                                                     | everyone now and in the future                  |

Source: Adapted from Musil 2003.
“The human heart is the first home of democracy. It is where we embrace our questions. Can we be equitable? Can we be generous? Can we listen with our whole beings, not just our minds, and offer our attention rather than our opinions? And do we have enough resolve in our hearts to act courageously, relentlessly, without giving up—ever—trusting our fellow citizens to join with us in our determined pursuit of a living democracy.”
AAC&U Resources

1. Diversity & Democracy
   www.aacu.org/diversitydemocracy

2. A Crucible Moment: College Learning and Democracy’s Future
   http://www.aacu.org/civic_learning/crucible/index.cfm

3. Civic Prompts: Making Civic Learning Routine Across the Disciplines
   Caryn McTighe Musil
   http://www.aacu.org/civicprompts

   http://www.aacu.org/PeerReview
FOR FURTHER INFORMATION

Caryn McTighe Musil
Senior Scholar and Director of Civic Learning and Democracy Initiatives
Association of American Colleges and Universities

musil@aacu.org www.aacu.org

To download or order *A Crucible Moment*, see:
http://www.aacu.org/civic_learning/crucible/index.cfm

To download or order *Diversity & Democracy*, see:
http://www.aacu.org/